



All Children Reading–Philippines eResources Review Toolkit

September 22, 2020

Prepared for use by DepEd to review resources for the DepEd
Commons



Table of Contents

	Page
About the Toolkit.....	ii
1. Planning Your eResource	1
2. Developing Your eResource	2
Table 1: eResource MetaData.....	2
3. Quality Review of Your eResource	4
Table 2.1: Compliance Fundamentals Checklist	4
Table 2.2: Value Proposition Checklist.....	4
Table 2.3: Audience Checklist.....	5
Table 2.4: Content Checklist	6
Table 2.5a: General Pedagogy Checklist.....	6
Table 2.5b: Guidance for Literacy Resources Checklist.....	7
Table 2.6: Presentation Checklist.....	10
Endnotes.....	11

Acknowledgements

This review toolkit was prepared by RTI International for use in the Philippines to review digital learning resources for the Department of Education (DepEd) Commons. It is specifically meant for resources related to early literacy but can be adapted for other subject areas. This version is based on a broader toolkit designed for use across countries developing digital resources in e-book, video, or other formats. For the purposes of eResources review in the Philippines, certain sections have been condensed or removed (such as criteria for video-based lessons) to make this version more concise. The original version was developed by Dr. Carmen Strigel and the project team from the U.S. Agency for International Development- (USAID-) funded Uzbekistan Education for Excellence Program. Sarah Pouezevara and Sadaam Bazer provided input for adaptation to literacy resources used in the Philippines. For a copy of the full, original document, please contact spouez@rti.org

This work is made available under a Creative Commons license CC BY-NC-SA. This allows it to be freely shared and adapted for noncommercial purposes with attribution to the original source. Any derivatives must also be made available under the same Creative Commons license.



About the Toolkit

This toolkit is designed for teachers, curriculum developers, instructional designers, and other specialists in education who produce eResources.

- ➔ eResources are defined as any digital text, graphics, animation, audio, or video that can be used by teachers or learners, individually or in an interactive manner.
- ➔ eResources are content units designed to achieve an explicit learning objective, that can be used independently or combined with other elements as part of a lesson or instructional program.
- ➔ eResources can manifest as a range of educational objects, including slideshows, apps, simulation activities, games, e-books, or assessments.
- ➔ Video-based lessons are eResources that cover an entire lesson or unit, and may integrate digital text, graphics, animation, audio, or video elements with a guiding teacher persona or voice and are distributed as a video file.

The toolkit includes tips and suggestions for planning, developing, or selecting eResources and review checklists. We recommend the checklists to be used twice: first during the planning and development stages of the eResources and then again when your eResource is ready for a final quality check.

The checklist will help you self-examine your eResource along six main categories:

- **Compliance:** Does it comply with applicable copyright laws?
- **Value proposition:** Does it apply properties of the digital format to add value?
- **Audience:** Is the design inclusive and appropriate for all target learners?
- **Content:** Is it accurate and focused on a specific curriculum-aligned objective?
- **Pedagogy:** Is it pedagogically appropriate for the subject and target skills?
- **Presentation:** Is the structure intuitive and effective for the user to navigate?



1. Planning Your eResource

A great lesson starts with great planning! Here are some tips for planning your eResource:

- Identify the **topic or theme** of the eResource (e.g., Literacy).
- Identify **the learning objectives** according to learning standards for the subject and grade. *What should your learners be able to do or know by the end of the activity?* Make these objectives as tangible and specific as possible. Consider using verbs, aligned with Bloom's taxonomy,ⁱ to help you write strong lesson objective statements. (e.g., Practice phonemic awareness by substituting beginning sounds).
- Clarify the **added value** that the electronic resource would provide above and beyond traditional teaching methods or materials. Does the eResource simply serve as a digital substitution of print, or does it actually improve the learning experience using features of technology (e.g., multimedia, interactive hotspots, automatic feedback, etc.)? Consider reviewing the Substitution, Augmentation, Modification, and Redefinition (SAMR) Model as a way to understand the differences.ⁱⁱ
- Decide what **lesson element(s)**—Past lesson reflection, introduction, demonstration, practice, application, assessment, extension or closure—will be covered and what content you will include for each element.
- Define the **aims** for each of these lesson elements. How will they contribute to achieving your stated learning objective?
- Consider **content**: Will the eResource be based on a textbook unit or another source, or will you develop your own content, or will it be a combination of all. What raw materials do you have to build on to ensure accuracy of the content, but also originality? What is the target length for the user?
- Consider how you will **engage** your learners or other users in actively *doing something* beyond just reading or listening to the digital resource, e.g., can you include an interaction such as mouseover utility, or drag and drop function; can you ask them to repeat words after you, solve a problem, come up with an example, draw or define a concept, make a physical movement, etc.?
- How will you give **feedback** or let learners check their answers to the tasks you have created? Will your eResource include an answer key, or automatic scoring functionality? Can you show an image or video of a problem solution pathway so they can compare their work with the model?
- Consider **follow-up** and extension activities: Is there a way that learners can immediately apply what they learned after they have engaged with the eResource, or extend the learning independently? Is there a recommended next resource to use?
- Check your content for **copyright** issues: if you use any content not produced by yourself originally, make sure its copyright allows for reuse and give reference to the sources for any text, image, or multimedia resource you use from others.
- Use the **eResource Self-review Checklist** at the end of this Toolkit (Tables 2.1–2.6) to see how well you have planned and make any changes to your eResource plan as needed.

2. Developing Your eResource

Now that you have a clear idea of what you want to accomplish and what your eResource will include, consider the following to develop the resources:

- For general eResources, ready all your content assets such as any text, images, graphics, or audio files as well as your authoring tool, e.g., Kotobee. Also review the features of the authoring tool and evaluate the added value of the digital functions according to the learning objective.
- Determine whether you need to submit all of the original content assets and the editable file, or only the final export. If you need to include all content assets, be sure the filename clearly indicates what it is, and ensure you can prove the original source and that the resource is free to reuse.
- For audio and video, decide what recording device(s) you will use. Test in advance device, software, and room settings to ensure video and audio quality is adequate and compatible with the authoring tool you will use.
- For video, ensure that you can include only the part of your room or computer screen that is required for the lesson and no other distracting items, such as posters on walls that do not relate to this lesson, views of your email inbox, or anything else private. Also, if you are talking about a table or a diagram as part of your lesson, it is a good idea to show that image in full screen at that moment, so that learners can see it well.
- Use the eResource Self-Review Checklist to systematically review the draft and final resource for any remaining improvement opportunities and to decide if your eResource is ready to be shared to support your learners' learning.
- Capture all of the metadata for your eResource using the following table that you will submit with the final eResource for approval and addition to the DepEd Commons.

Table 1: eResource MetaData

Information Category	Answer
Target audience (learner, parent/guardian, teacher, other)	
Language of instruction	
Grade level/s	
Subject	
Topic/Unit/Theme	
eResource title	
Link to student learning standard/ curriculum reference number (if applicable)	
Length/estimated minutes for completion (in minutes)	
Is your eResource based on a learner textbook, teacher guide, or free form? (If linked to a book or guide, note down textbook title and targeted textbook page numbers)	

Information Category	Answer
Is your eResource a stand-alone objective or part of a lesson or a series or progression?	
If your eResource is already uploaded to the web or a web-based system, provide the link here.	
Provide here link/s to other learning materials associated with the eResource (e.g., sources of copyrighted materials) used in the making of the eResources.	
eResource production date	
eResource author name and affiliation	
eResource copyright information (for example, the Creative Commons attribution type)	
Raw data filename and location	
Exported/Published eResource filename and location	

3. Quality Review of Your eResource

Use this checklist to complete a self-review when you are planning the development of your eResource. Do a second self- or peer-review once you have finished for a final quality assurance check before submission. Consider also finding a colleague, friend, or family member who could try out your resource—you might be surprised at what a different person will notice about functionality, ease of use, or clarity of the text.

Note that not all elements necessarily need to be present for a resource to be considered sufficient. Some of the elements in the checklist may not be applicable for every resource. Aim to use your best judgement in deciding how many of the criteria must be met before the resource can be submitted.

These checklists do not replace any existing content and quality standards for DepEd instructional resources already being used. It is assumed that you already adhere to DepEd style and content requirements, and these items related to eResources are supplementary.

In each table, enter a check mark in the box for each item on the first and second reviews. Space is provided to make notes.

Table 2.1: Compliance Fundamentals Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
1.1	If re-using any text or materials developed by others, the text or audio script has been rewritten to avoid plagiarism, or clearly cited the source if not.			
1.2	If the eResource includes any text, images, artwork, video, and/or music tracks produced by others, permission has been granted for use and the resource clearly references the original author and link to the source of the material, if allowable.			

Table 2.2: Value Proposition Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
2.1	Includes functional improvements (e.g., replay, multimedia, repeated practice) that augment and not distract from the learning experience and would otherwise not be possible in traditional lesson delivery.			
2.2	Includes significant task redesign or experience improvements (e.g., visualization, simulations, manipulation of objects, adaptation of reading text difficulty or size) that would otherwise not be possible.			

Table 2.3: Audience Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
3.1	Content aligns to the expected skills and prior knowledge of the target learner (e.g., from prior lessons/earlier pages in textbook/earlier units in curriculum, etc.).			
3.2	The functionality is accessible to the target age group (for example, avoids touch screen gestures like Drag & Drop, Free Rotate, Pinch, and Spread that might be difficult for learners under 7 years of age to execute). ⁱⁱⁱ			
3.3	If the eResource requires reading any text, including instructions or navigation, the reading level (word length, difficulty, vocabulary concept, and language) matches what a child at that grade level should know.			
3.4	Any video is under 6 minutes, as per evidence-based optimal length. ^{iv}			
3.5	Text, images, sound, and video are inclusive, fair, and equal in treatment of diverse groups including persons with disabilities, persons of all genders, and persons of all nationalities and ethnic and language groups.			
3.6	Incorporates strategies, materials, and activities for differentiation that consider the needs of diverse students.			
3.7	Makes use of technological features that accommodate diverse learner needs, e.g., functionality to increase font size, change color contrast, or text-to-speech output.			
3.8	Includes subtitles or language switching options.			
3.9	Includes sign language for any video presentation.			

Table 2.4: Content Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
4.1	The content/material is up to date, reflecting current knowledge and advancements in the field.			
4.2	The content is accurate.			
4.3	Text is free of errors (e.g., spelling, punctuation, inconsistent capitalization, etc.) and reflects the current approved orthography for the language of the text. (If in doubt, consult an expert!)			
4.4	Content aligns with the stated learning objective and focuses only on that objective without other distracting information.			
4.5	Content aligns with the stated student learning standard or standards.			
4.6	Content builds on learners' prior knowledge.			
4.7	Includes content and tasks familiar and relevant to the learners' life, interests, and activities.			

Table 2.5a: General Pedagogy Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
5.1	Captures and keeps learners' attention.			
5.2	Clearly explains to the learner what the resource is about.			
5.3	Includes opportunities for learners to practice the lesson content.			
5.4	Includes opportunities for learners to explore multiple perspectives or alternative solutions about the lesson content.			
5.5	Includes activities that allow learners to identify key ideas or summarize content.			
5.6	Includes an opportunity for learner self-assessment or knowledge check.			
5.7	Provides an opportunity for learners to reflect on their learning.			



1st

2nd

Notes

5.8 Provides guidance for self-directed extension of the learning outside of the eResource, through homework or follow-up activities in other eResources.

Table 2.5b: Guidance for Literacy Resources Checklist^v

	1 st	2 nd	Notes
5.9	The focus remains on the literacy-learning experience throughout (not games or distracting interactions).		
5.10	Use of digital features and interactivity (i.e., sound effects, reactive touch elements, speech-to-text) is purposeful and enhances the educational potential of the resource rather than distracts.		
5.11	<p>Content is functionally and developmentally appropriate for the target age range.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> For beginning readers: has oral narration with text highlighting (audio read-aloud); allows practice decoding For emerging readers: offers vocabulary development and simple comprehension (recall) exercises For advanced readers: offers fluency development and higher-order comprehension 		
5.12	<p>If the eResource aims to improve students' understanding of <u>concepts of print</u>, includes any of the following activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explicit instruction of the concept of words, letters, sounds, and print directionality Explicit attention to the authors, illustrators, or other parts of a book (If other, note) 		
5.13	<p>If the eResource aims to improve <u>phonemic awareness</u>, includes any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rhyming poems or songs Clapping syllables Segmenting letter sounds Blending letter sounds Substituting one letter for another (If other, note) 		

5.14	<p>If the eResource aims to improve <u>phonics</u>, includes any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Letter-sound identification • Onset and rime • Letter-sound association • Blending sounds to recognize words • Practice writing or tracing letters • (If other, note)
5.15	<p>If the eResource aims to improve <u>word recognition</u>, includes any of the following activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exposure and practice of words and word chunks (prefixes, suffixes, etc.) in meaningful, connected texts • Audio read-aloud to practice word identification and pronunciation • Pictures associated with words or audio dictionary tool • Spelling practice • (If other, note)
5.16	<p>If the eResource aims to improve <u>language development</u>, includes any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Audio read-aloud • Repeat words and phrases from model reading with expression (echo speech) • Repeated reading (echo reading)
5.17	<p>If the eResource aims to improve <u>vocabulary</u>, includes any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Audio read-aloud • Repeated reading, word repetition • Encounter words in connected texts • Practice with word morphology, word roots, prefixes/suffixes • Talk about text and word meanings • Pictures associated with words or audio dictionary tool

5.18 If the eResource aims to improve comprehension, includes any of the following:

- Pre-read and make predictions
- Ask and answer questions
- Graphic organizers
- Visualization
- Respond to text
- Summarize
- Retell
- Read variety of genres

5.19 If the eResource aims to improve writing, includes of the following activities:

- Connect writing to authentic purposes
- Share writing
- Explicit instruction of skills and mechanics

5.20 If the eResource aims to support dual language development or literacy bridging, includes any of the following:

- Options for translation or switching from one language to another
- Explicitly draw attention to similarities and differences in letter sounds, morphology, the meaning of words and word parts in both languages
- Audio read-aloud or speech-to-text features to practice pronunciation

5.21 Does the eResource provide other added value literacy support and scaffolding, e.g., the ability to change text difficulty or a glossary for vocabulary look up?

Table 2.6: Presentation Checklist



		1 st	2 nd	Notes
6.1	Image and video resolution are adequate, such that all details are visible.			
6.2	Transitions between eResource screens, slides, or video frames are consistent and seamless.			
6.3	Navigation is intuitive (e.g., navigation and interaction options are clearly displayed, and buttons or icons provide visual cues to repeated eResource elements).			
6.4	All text is legible and uses appropriate font (Century Gothic is standard for DepEd literacy materials)			
6.5	All visual elements fit the eResource screen, slide, or video frame.			
6.6	There are no unnecessary visual elements that might distract learners.			
6.7	Audio is high quality and discernable (including clear of background noise, and volume adjusted).			
6.8	Audio and imagery are synced appropriately, with no lags.			
6.9	Error messages and watermarks referring to unlicensed widgets or photos have been removed by purchasing the license or using a different compatible widget.			

Endnotes

- i For one possible resource on verbs related to Bloom’s Taxonomy, consider <http://www.northeastern.edu/nuolirc/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Blooms-Taxonomy-Handout.pdf>
- ii For one possible resource describing the SAMR model, consider <https://www.edutopia.org/article/powerful-model-understanding-good-tech-integration>
- iii See:
- Lim, K. Y. T., Comings, J., Lee, R., Yuen, M. D., Hilmy, A., Chua, D., & Song, B. H. (2018). *Guide to Developing Digital Games for Early Grade Literacy for Developing Countries*. Quezon City, Philippines: Foundation for Information Technology Education and Development, Inc.
- World Vision, Inc. or Azah, N., Syuhada, N., Batmaz, F., Stone, R., & Wai, P. (2014). Selection of touch gestures for children’s applications: repeated experiment to increase reliability. *International Journal of Advanced Computer Science and Applications*, 5(4). doi:10.14569/ijacsa.2014.050415
- iv Guo, P.J., Kim, J., & Rubin, R. (2014, March). How video production affects student engagement: an empirical study of MOOC videos. L@S '14. Proceedings of the first ACM conference on Learning @ Scale, 41–50. doi:10.1145/2556325.2566239
- v Criteria adapted from:
- Cahill, M., & McGill-Franzen, A. (2013). Selecting “App”ealing and “App”ropriate book apps for beginning readers. *The Reading Teacher*, 67(1), 30–39. doi:10.1002/trtr.1190
- Israelson, M. H. (2015). The App Map. *The Reading Teacher*, 69(3), 339–349. doi:10.1002/trtr.1414
- Zipke, M. (2013). Building an e-book library. *The Reading Teacher*, 67(5), 375–383. doi:10.1002/trtr.1221

Other resources:

- Achieve. (n.d.). *Open Educational Resources Evaluation Tool Handbook*. Retrieved from <https://www.achieve.org/files/AchieveOEREvaluationToolHandbookFINAL.pdf>
- Achieve. (2020). *Achieve OER Rubrics Training Materials*. Retrieved from <https://www.achieve.org/achieve-oer-rubrics-training-materials>
- Florida State University. (2019). *CPALMS Resources Review*. Retrieved from <https://www.cpalms.org/Resource/review.aspx>